



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO  
FACULTY OF LAW

# **MODERN POLITICAL TRIALS (HIS1271HS) (LAW342H1S)**

## **Volume 1/2**

**Professor Michael R. Marrus**

**Winter 2011**




**MODERN POLITICAL TRIALS  
(HIS1271HS) (LAW342H1S)**

**Volume 1/2**

**Professor Michael R. Marrus**

**Winter 2011**



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

[https://archive.org/details/modernpoliticalt01marr\\_2](https://archive.org/details/modernpoliticalt01marr_2)

**UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO**  
**Faculty of Law/Department of History**

**LAW 342H1S/HIS 1271**  
**Modern Political Trials**  
**Winter Term, 2011**

Falconer Hall, Room 1 (FA 1)  
84 Queen's Park

Thursdays: 10:30 a.m. to 12:20 p.m.

What are political trials? According to one recent definition, these are trials in which the outcome "depends on an evaluation of the defendant's political attitudes and activities." Among other things, this seminar course will test that definition, and begins with the hypothesis that there can be other sorts of political trials, in which courtroom arguments speak to issues of political importance in different societies. Many different circumstances, it should become clear, can contribute to making trials political. To examine these propositions, we will look at European, North American and Israeli trials in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The approach will be interdisciplinary, and will draw upon legal, political, historical and social analyses of the various trials selected for the course.

This year's topics, together with the trials that highlight them, will be:

- Politics and Madness: Daniel McNaughtan and the Insanity Defense, 1843
- Treason: The Queen v. Louis Riel, 1885
- Homosexuality: The Trials of Oscar Wilde, 1895
- Terrorism: Dealing with the Assassinations of Simon Petlura, 1927 and King Alexander of Yugoslavia, 1934
- Show Trial: The Case of the Anti-Soviet Bloc of Rights and Trotskyites, 1938
- International Criminal Law I: The Trial of the Major German War Criminals at Nuremberg, 1945-46
- International Criminal Law II: Subsequent Proceedings at Nuremberg under Control Council Law No. 10
- Holocaust: The Attorney General of Israel v. Adolf Eichmann, 1962
- Atrocity: My Lai and the Trial of Lieutenant William Calley, 1970
- Crimes against Humanity: Touvier-Barbie-Papon, 1964-99
- Law and History: Irving v. Penguin, Limited & Deborah Lipstadt, 2000
- Holocaust Restitution: Art, 1995 – present

Students should purchase the case book for this course, available in the Faculty of Law Bookstore:

***Modern Political Trials: LAW 342H1S/HIS 1271 (Faculty of Law, 2011)***

Students may also wish to consult the remarkable Web site "Famous Trials," by Professor Douglas Linder of the University of Missouri-Kansas City School of Law, for a wealth of material on "famous trials":

<http://www.law.umkc.edu/faculty/projects/ftrials/ftrials.htm>



**Office Hours:**

Tuesdays and Fridays, 9:00 to 10:00 a.m., or by appointment. My office is in Massey College, II-3. I can be most easily reached via email: [michael.marrus@utoronto.ca](mailto:michael.marrus@utoronto.ca) or by telephone at Massey (416-946-0648).

**Email:**

I will respond quickly to all appropriate email messages, and this is the easiest way to reach me – especially for communications regarding office appointments, specific reading assignments, etc. Generally speaking, questions that could be of interest to all students should be raised in class.

**Course Requirements and Grade Distribution:**

**Essays:** One short essay (1500 words) comparing two of the trials discussed in the course, due on **March 3**, and worth 15 percent; and one longer essay (7500 words), entitled "Reflections on Political Trials," drawing upon themes discussed in the course, due at noon on **April 28 at 10:00 a.m.**, and worth 70 percent. *Please note: The deadline for the final submission of papers is fixed by the faculty and I cannot grant extensions beyond that point except in emergency situations and then through a university established process.*

**Participation:** 15 percent, based on attendance and class participation.

**Academic Misconduct:**

Students should know and understand the University's *Code of Behavior on Academic Matters*, particularly its sections dealing with plagiarism. For further information, please see <http://www.utoronto.ca/govcncl/pap/policies/behaveac.html>

**SEMINAR****TOPIC AND ASSIGNED READING****January 6****Introduction**

Important for students to attend.

**January 13****Politics and Madness: Daniel McNaughtan and the Insanity Defense, 1843 (Volume 1, Page 1)**

Richard Moran, *Knowing Right from Wrong: The Insanity Defense of Daniel McNaughtan* (New York: The Free Press, 1981), 1-6, 77-142.

**Supplementary:**

Richard Moran, "The Modern Foundation for the Insanity Defense: The Cases of James Hadfield (1800) and Daniel McNaughtan (1843)," *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 477 (1985), 31-42.

Joel Peter Eigen, "Lesion of the Will: Medical Resolve and Criminal Responsibility in Victorian Insanity Trials," *Law & Society Review*, 33 (1999), 425-59.

Morris B. Hoffman and Stephen J. Morse, "The Insanity Defense Goes Back on Trial," *New York Times*, July 30, 2006.

## January 20

### **Treason: The Trial of Louis Riel, 1885 (Volume 1, Page 94)**

Doug Linder, "The Trial of Louis Riel" (2004), *Famous Trials*, 1-6.  
<http://www.law.umkc.edu/faculty/projects/ftrials/riel/rielaccount.html>

Desmond Morton, ed., *The Queen v Louis Riel* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1974), 2-7, 194-215, 239-68, 284-351, 371-2.

#### **Supplementary:**

Maggie Siggins, *Riel: A Life of Revolution* (Toronto: HarperCollins, 1994), 410-48.

Thomas Flanagan, "Louis Riel: Insanity and Prophecy," in Howard Palmer, ed., *The Settlement of the West* (Calgary:Comprint, 1977), 15-36.

Thomas Flanagan and Neil Watson, "The Riel Trial Revisited: Criminal Procedure and Law in 1885," *Saskatchewan History*, XXXIV (1981), 527-73.

## January 27

### **Homosexuality: The Trials of Oscar Wilde, 1895 (Volume 1, Page 22)**

Doug Linder, "The Trials of Oscar Wilde," *Famous Trials*, 1-6.  
<http://www.law.umkc.edu/faculty/projects/ftrials/wilde/wildeaccount.html>

H. Montgomery Hyde, ed., *The Three Trials of Oscar Wilde* (New York: University Books, 1956), 105-339.

#### **Supplementary:**

Michael S. Foldy, *The Trials of Oscar Wilde: Deviance, Morality, and Late-Victorian Society* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997), 1-96.

## February 3

### **Terrorism: Dealing with the Assassinations of Simon Petlura, 1927 and King Alexander of Yugoslavia, 1934 (Volume 1, Page 406)**

"Petlura Trial," *Time*, November 7, 1927.

Saul S. Friedman, *Pogromchik: The Assassination of Simon Petlura* (New York: Hart, 1976), 94-167, 306-43.

Film of the 1934 Assassination, Universal Studios, 3 min. 9 sec.  
[http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B0pyyt\\_G0U8](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B0pyyt_G0U8)

Alternative video, with musical sound track:  
<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SrruCOZwxKA>

Ben Saul, "The Legal Response of the League of Nations to Terrorism," *Journal of International Criminal Justice*, 4 (2006), 78-102.

"Convention for the Prevention and Punishment of Terrorism, 19 League of Nations O.J. 23 (1938)," in M. Cherif Bassiouni, *International Terrorism: Multilateral Conventions (1937-2001)* (New York: Transnational Publishers, 2001), 71-8.

**Supplementary:**

David Engel, "Being Lawful in a Lawless World: The Trial of Scholem Schwartzbard and the defense of East European Jews," *Simon Dubnow Institute Year Book*, 5 (2006), 83-97.

**February 10**

**Show Trial: The Case of the Anti-Soviet Bloc of Rights and Trotskyites, 1938 (Volume 1, Page 520)**

Robert C. Tucker, "Introduction: Stalin, Bukharin and History as Conspiracy," in Robert C. Tucker and Stephen F. Cohen, eds., *The Great Purge Trial* (New York: Grosset & Dunlap, 1965), ix-xlvi.

Trial Transcript, Robert C. Tucker and Stephen F. Cohen, eds., *The Great Purge Trial* (New York: Grosset & Dunlap, 1965), 5-37, 157-58, 514-60, 656-68, 681-9.

**Supplementary:**

Stephen F. Cohen, *Bukharin and the Bolshevik Revolution: A Political Biography, 1888-1938* (new edn., Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1980), 372-81.

**February 17**

**International Criminal Law I: The Trial of the Major German War Criminals at Nuremberg, 1945-46 (Volume 1, Page 605)**

Michael R. Marrus, *The Nuremberg War Crimes Trial 1945-46: A Documentary History* (Boston: Bedford, 1997), 1-77.

International Military Tribunal, *Trial of the Major War Criminals before the International Military Tribunal, Nuremberg, 14 November 1945- 1 October 1946*, 42 vols. (Nuremberg: International Military Tribunal, 1947), II: 98-105, 153-4. (Robert H. Jackson, Opening Address for the United States).

Michael R. Marrus, *The Nuremberg War Crimes Trial 1945-46: A Documentary History* (Boston: Bedford, 1997), 104-117, 180-3.



(Hermann Göring Testimony and Cross-Examination by Robert H. Jackson)

International Military Tribunal, *Trial of the Major War Criminals before the International Military Tribunal, Nuremberg, 14 November 1945- 1 October 1946*, 42 vols. (Nuremberg: International Military Tribunal, 1947), I: 218-26, 247-57. (Judgment)

**Supplementary:**

Lawrence Douglas, *The Memory of Judgment: Making Law and History in the Trials of the Holocaust* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001), 38-64.

**February 24**

**Reading Week**

**March 3**

**International Criminal Law II: Allied Proceedings under Control Council Law No. 10 (Volume 2, Page 1)**

Telford Taylor, *Final Report to the Secretary of the Army on the Nuernberg War Crimes Trials under Control Council Law No. 10* (Washington, D.C., August 15, 1949, pp. i-viii, 1-12, 63-112.

Donald Bloxham, *Genocide on Trial: War Crimes Trials and the Formation of Holocaust History and Memory* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), Ch. 1.

Jonathan Friedman, "Law and Politics in the Subsequent Nuremberg Trials, 1946-1949," in Patricia Heberer and Jürgen Matthäus, eds., *Atrocities on Trial: Historical Perspectives on the Politics of Prosecuting War Crimes* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2008), pp. 75-101.

**March 10**

**Holocaust: The Attorney General of Israel v. Adolf Eichmann, 1962 (Volume 2, Page 77)**

"Judgment," State of Israel, Ministry of Justice, *The Trial of Adolf Eichmann: Record of Proceedings in the District Court of Jerusalem*, 9 vols. (Jerusalem: Trust for the Publication of the Proceedings of the Eichmann Trial, 1994), V: 2082-4.

Lawrence Douglas, *The Memory of Judgment: Making Law and History in the Trials of the Holocaust* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001), 97-182.

**Supplementary:**

Leora Bilsky, *Transformative Justice: Israeli Identity on Trial* (Ann Arbor, Michigan: University of Michigan Press, 2004), 85-165.

Covey Oliver, "Judicial Decisions," *American Journal of International Law*, 56 (1962), 805-45.

**March 17                      Atrocity: My Lai and the Court Martial of Lieutenant William Calley, 1970 (Volume 2, Page 211)**

Doug Linder, "An Introduction to the My Lai Courts-Martial," Famous American Trials: the My Lai Courts Martial, 1970  
[http://www.law.umkc.edu/faculty/projects/ftrials/mylai/Myl\\_intro.html](http://www.law.umkc.edu/faculty/projects/ftrials/mylai/Myl_intro.html)

Michal R. Belknap, *The Vietnam War on Trial: The My Lai Massacre and the Court Martial of Lieutenant Calley* (Lawrence, Kansas: University Press of Kansas Press, 2002), 98-190.

James S. Olson and Randy Roberts, *My Lai: A Brief History with Documents* (Boston: Bedford/St. Martin's, 1998), 174-99.

**March 24                      Crimes against Humanity: Touvier-Barbie-Papon, 1964-99 (Volume 2, Page 284)**

Henry Rousso, "Did the Purge Achieve its Goals?" in Richard J. Goslan, ed., *Memory, the Holocaust, and French Justice: The Bousquet and Touvier Affairs* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1996), 100-4.

Vivian Grosswald Curran, "Politicizing the Crime Against Humanity: the French Example," *Notre Dame Law Review*, 78 (2003), 677-710.

Leila Sadat Wexler, "The Interpretation of the Nuremberg Principles by the French Court of Cassation: From Touvier to Barbie and Back Again," *Columbia Journal of Transnational Law*, 32 (1994-1995), 292-380.

Leila Nadya Sadat, "The Legal Legacy of Maurice Papon," in Richard J. Goslan, ed., *The Papon Affair: Memory and Justice on Trial* (New York: Routledge, 2000), 131-60.

**Supplementary:**

Guyora Binder, "Representing Nazism: Advocacy and Identity at the Trial of Klaus Barbie," *Yale Law Journal*, 98 (1989), 1321-39, 1355-72.

**March 31                      Law and History: Irving v. Penguin, Limited & Deborah Lipstadt, 2000 (Volume 2, Page 472)**

Richard Evans, "History, Memory, and the Law: The Historian as Expert Witness," *History and Theory*, 41 (October 2002), 326-45.

Richard J. Evans, *Lying about Hitler: History, Holocaust, and the David Irving Trial* (New York: Basic Books, 2001), 1-39.

Deborah E. Lipstadt, *History on Trial* (New York: Harper Collins, 1985), 77-108, 127-49, 185-209, 254-64.

Mr. Justice Charles Gray, Judgement, April 11, 2000, Sections XIII-XIV. <http://www.nizkor.org/hweb/people/i/irving-david/judgment-00-00.html>

**April 7      Restitution: Art and the Holocaust, 1995 – present (Volume 2, Page 606)**

Michael Bazyler, *Holocaust Justice: The Battle for Restitution in America's Courts* (New York: New York University Press, 2003), Ch. 5

Michael R. Marrus, *Some Measure of Justice: The Holocaust Era Restitution Campaign of the 1990s* (Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press, 2009), Ch. 2.

